Discussion: The Interest of Being Eligible

Mesonnier, O'Donnell and Toutain (2017)

Jean-David Sigaux

European Central Bank

Disclaimer: The views expressed do not necessarily reflect those of the ECB

The Paper

- **The paper's starting points**
  1. Bank loans reduce a lender's liquidity

The Paper

- **The paper's starting points**
  1. Bank loans reduce a lender's liquidity
  2. Liquidity should be priced into bank loans

The Paper

- **The paper's starting points**
  1. Bank loans reduce a lender's liquidity
  2. Liquidity should be priced into bank loans
  3. The ability to use an asset as collateral should increase the asset's liquidity

The Paper

- **The paper's starting points**
  1. Bank loans reduce a lender's liquidity
  2. Liquidity should be priced into bank loans
  3. The ability to use an asset as collateral should increase the asset's liquidity

- **Question asked in the paper**
  - Is the rate on a bank loan sensitive to the ability of using the loan as collateral?

The Paper

- **The paper's starting points**
  1. Bank loans reduce a lender's liquidity
  2. Liquidity should be priced into bank loans
  3. The ability to use an asset as collateral should increase the asset's liquidity

- **Question asked in the paper**
  - Is the rate on a bank loan sensitive to the ability of using the loan as collateral?

- **The paper's answer: Yes it is**
  - A change in collateral eligibility for "ECB money" decreased rates by 7bps for newly eligible loans

The Paper

- **The paper's starting points**
  1. Bank loans reduce a lender's liquidity
  2. Liquidity should be priced into bank loans
  3. The ability to use an asset as collateral should increase the asset's liquidity

- **Question asked in the paper**
  - Is the rate on a bank loan sensitive to the ability of using the loan as collateral?

- **The paper's answer: Yes it is**
  - A change in collateral eligibility for "ECB money" decreased rates by 7bps for newly eligible loans
  - Only for banks that effectively choose to use these loans as collateral

The Paper

- **The paper's starting points**
  1. Bank loans reduce a lender's liquidity
  2. Liquidity should be priced into bank loans
  3. The ability to use an asset as collateral should increase the asset's liquidity
- **Question asked in the paper**
  - Is the rate on a bank loan sensitive to the ability of using the loan as collateral?
- **The paper's answer: Yes it is**
  - A change in collateral eligibility for "ECB money" decreased rates by 7bps for newly eligible loans
  - Only for banks that effectively choose to use these loans as collateral
- $\Rightarrow$ **Relevant question, very interesting paper**

Comments #1: Magnitude of the effects

- **How is the pie divided between lenders and borrowers?**
  - 7bps is what the borrowers gained: How much did the lender gained?

Comments #1: Magnitude of the effects

- **How is the pie divided between lenders and borrowers?**
  - 7bps is what the borrowers gained: How much did the lender gained?
- **What is the effect on the "control" loans?**
  - You found an effect on the newly-eligible loans: What about the other loans?

Comments #1: Magnitude of the effects

- **How is the pie divided between lenders and borrowers?**
  - 7bps is what the borrowers gained: How much did the lender gained?
- **What is the effect on the "control" loans?**
  - You found an effect on the newly-eligible loans: What about the other loans?
- **Confounding effects**: Is part of the effect attributed to LTRO?
  - LTRO might have a different effect for the low than the high borrower types
  - If so, you are over/under-estimating the effect of the ACC

Comments #2: Compare to traditional liquidity (1/2)

Framework

One relevant question that this paper could touch upon:
Should the regulator increase traditional liquidity or collateral liquidity?

Comments #2: Compare to traditional liquidity (1/2)

Framework

One relevant question that this paper could touch upon:
Should the regulator increase traditional liquidity or collateral liquidity?

- **Traditional liquidity**: Ability to quickly sell (or buy) at "fundamental price"
  - *e.g. When selling*: You get cash + You are no longer exposed to asset's risk

Comments #2: Compare to traditional liquidity (1/2)

Framework

One relevant question that this paper could touch upon:
Should the regulator increase traditional liquidity or collateral liquidity?

- **Traditional liquidity**: Ability to quickly sell (or buy) at "fundamental price"
  - *e.g. When selling*: You get cash + You are no longer exposed to asset's risk
- **Collateral liquidity**: Ability to quickly get (provide) cash at "fundamental rate"
  - *e.g. When selling*: You get cash but you are still exposed to the asset's risk

⇒ **Collateral liquidity is a substitute: Both types of liquidity allow to get cash**
⇒ **Collateral liquidity is an innovation: Allows to separate cash from risk**

Comments #2: Compare to traditional liquidity (2/2)

Test the following predictions

1. **Test the extent in which collateral liquidity is a substitute**
    - Prediction: Lower securitization volume $\Rightarrow$ Larger post-ACC change

Comments #2: Compare to traditional liquidity (2/2)

Test the following predictions

1. **Test the extent in which collateral liquidity is a substitute**
   - Prediction: Lower securitization volume $\Rightarrow$ Larger post-ACC change
2. **Test the extent in which collateral liquidity is an innovation**
   - Prediction: Riskier asset $\Rightarrow$ Larger post-ACC change

If you're lucky, securitization volume is not fully determined by risk

Wrap-up

Very interesting paper with a relevant question

Wrap-up

Very interesting paper with a relevant question

1. **Strengthen current results**: Look into the magnitude of the effects
    - How the pie is shared
    - How the effect goes beyond the newly eligible loans
    - Make sure you do not capture LTRO

Wrap-up

Very interesting paper with a relevant question

1. **Strengthen current results**: Look into the magnitude of the effects
    - How the pie is shared
    - How the effect goes beyond the newly eligible loans
    - Make sure you do not capture LTRO
2. **Generate new results**: Test substitutability and innovation of collateral liquidity